Imposed Borders in a Balkan Landscape and Its Literary Impact: The vision of Christians and Greeks in Ismail Kadare's *Chronicle in Stone*

Andronikos Falangas (Chicago)

Imposed Borders upon a Multicultural Society

The mountain region of Epirus is a typical example of Balkan complexity. Situated at an important commercial crossroad, it is inhabited by a native population speaking Greek, Albanian and Vlach, also known as Aromanian, an Eastern Romance language related to the Romanian language. Almost all of this population declares allegiance to the Christian Orthodox religion or to Islam, although up until World War II, Epirus was the homeland of a Greek speaking Jewish community. Today, it is divided between Greece and Albania, following the partition of the Ottoman possessions at the end of the Balkan Wars in 1913. The Albanian part of Epirus is frequently referenced by the Greeks as Northern Epirus (Bóqειος Ἡπειφος), a name which may offend the national sensibility of the Albanians, who instead use the term Southern Albania (Jugu i Shqipërisë) ¹.

The national borders severed secular caravan routes, isolated Epirus from the broader South Eastern European economic space and impeded the traditional lucrative activity of its people in the South Eastern European metropolises like Constantinople and Bucharest². Ethnic tensions abounded. A major source were claims for autonomy and human rights for the Greek population living on the Albanian side of the border, a problem which worsened after the establishment in 1944 of the communist administration, causing a Greek exodus from Albania, oriented largely towards the U.S.³. Despite the collapse of communist regime in 1991, a number of serious incidents related to the human rights of the Greek minority enhanced the already existing suspicion and mistrust between Greeks and Albanians⁴. Furthermore, the property claims in Greek Epirus by the Muslim Albanians, the so called Chams (Alb.

- 1 Tom J. Winnifrith: Badlands-Borderland: A History of Southern Albania/Northern Epirus. London 2003. On the geography, history and the ethnic composition of Epirus before the turmoil of the Balkan Wars: Panagiotis Aravantinos: Πεοιγοαφή της Ηπείφου [Description of Epirus] 1–3. Ioannina 1984; Ioannis Lampridis: Ηπειφωτικά Μελετήματα [Epirote Studies] 1–10. Athens 1887–1890; reprint Ioannina 1993.
- 2 Beginning in the second half of the sixteenth century, the Epirotans became impressively active in the Romanian space: Ariadna Camariano-Cioran: Contributions à l'Histoire des relations gréco-roumaines, L'Épire et les Pays roumains. Ioannina 1984; Andronikos Falangas: «Ascension et stratégies sociales dans le Sud-Est Européen aux XVIe-XVIIe siècles. De quelques Épirotes anoblis dans les Pays roumains». Interbalkanica. Rapports de Congrès. Athens 2006, 73–86.
- 3 See Basil J. Pнотоs: Search for Liberty, An Autobiography. River Vale, New Jersey 2002.
- 4 See Miranda Vickers, James Pettifer: Albania: From Anarchy to Balkan Identity. New York 2000, 186–200.

Çamë, Gr. Τσάμηδες), who were expelled by the Greek partisans in 1944, under the accusation of collaboration with the Axis forces, even to this day complicate Greek-Albanian relations3. Another cause of tension in the region emerged due to a group of Vlachs (Alb. Vlleh, Gr. Βλάχοι, Armânj in their own language), who considered themselves to be a discrete part of the Romanian nation. Their efforts for political and cultural emancipation produced a dramatic schism within the Vlach population and further convoluted inter-Balkan relations⁶. Greek Epirus in the twentieth century also saw the destruction of two entire communities for external reasons. More precisely its entire Turkish population was expelled to Turkey, in accordance with the Treaty of Lausanne signed in 1923, in the aftermath of the Greeks' failed campaign in Asia Minor. As for the second community, the Romaniote Jews (Gr. Ρωμανιώτες), considered the oldest Jewish presence in Europe, were massively deported by the Nazi troops and most all of them perished in the concentration camps'. Finally, I do not want to ignore another people present for many centuries in the Epirote space, the Roma people, referred to by the terms Gypsies (Alb. Evgjitë, Gr. Γύφτοι) and Tziganes (Alb. Ciganë, Gr. Τσιγγάνοι), language charged with derogatory connotation. Subjected to constant discrimination, they largely worked as musicians, a profession which was far from esteemed. Nevertheless, by performing the Epirote musical tradition, they greatly contributed to the local folk culture. Another act, the bloodiest, of the Epirus' tragedy in the twentieth century was the confrontation between communists and nationalists, during and after the Second World War, on the both sides of Greek-Albanian border. This confrontation became aggravated in Greece after the Nazi's retreat by a civil war which haunted Greek political life for decades. The mountain region of Epirus, ideal for a guerilla action, became the main theater of this war which brought more suffering to the local population, already devastated by the Axis occupation. In Albania the same confrontation ended in 1944 with the triumph of the communist partisans led by Enver HOXHA, who originated from Gjirokastër, the Greek's Argyrokastro, a key city in the Albanian part of Epirus. It was the beginning of a regime of terror which culminated by isolating Albania from the rest of the world and banning any type of religious worship⁸.

- 5 Ibid., 207-208; Mark Mazower: "Three Forms of Political Justice: Greece 1944-1945" in idem (ed.): After the War Was Over: Reconstructing the Family, Nation, and State in Greece, 1943-1960. Princeton 2000, 24-6.
- 6 Max D. Peyfuss: Die Aromunische Frage: Ihre Entwicklung von den Ursprüngen bis zum Frieden von Bukarest (1913) und die Haltung Österreich-Ungarns. Vienna, Cologne, Graz 1974; Tom J. Winnifrith: The Vlachs: The History of a Balkan People. London 1987; Nicolas Trifon, Thede Kahl, Stamatis Beis: Les Aroumains, un peuple qui s'en va Paris 2005; Thede Kahl: Για την ταυτότητα των Βλάχων: Εθνοπολιτισμικέςς ποσεγγίσεις μιας βαλκανικής παρα-γματικότητας [The Identity of the Vlach: Ethnocultural Approaches of a Balkan Reality]. Athens 2009.
- 7 Rae Dalven: The Jews of Ioannina. Philadelphia 1990.
- 8 About Hoxha's regime, Arshi Pipa: Albanian Stalinism. Boulder 1990; for a Greek-Albanian witness of the regime's brutality: Menas S. Paras (Pappas): Σαρανταέξι χρόνια στα κάτεργα της δικτατορίας του Εμβέρ Χότζα (1945–1991) [Forty-six years in the forced labor camps of Enver Hoxha's dictatorship]. Athens 1997; see also the recent article of Ni-

At the end of this introduction, I have to pose the following questions which constitute the starting point of the present paper: What is the perception of Epirus' tragic reality by the internationally recognized Albanian novelist, Ismail Kadare, born, like Hoxha, in Gjirokastër? Does he submit his pen to an objective analysis or to a political cause? Does he contribute to the harmonious coexistence of all his compatriots or sustain long existing ethnic and politic rivalries? This paper serves this quest through an analysis of the *Chronicle in Stone (Kronikë në gur)*, one of his best known writings first published in Albanian in 1971.

Kadare's book, *Chronicle in Stone*, can be conceived of as a chronicle. The author, through the eyes of a child reports the events which took place in his native city, Gjirokastër, covering a period of three years. This period starts approximately one year after the annexation of Albania to fascist Italy, in April 1939, or several months before the unsuccessful Italian invasion of Greece, in October 1940. It ends in 1943, at the moment the Nazis obtained the control of Gjirokastër, in the aftermath of the Italians' capitulation to the Allies. During this entire period, we see the city changing hands between the Italian and Greeks, enduring air strikes, joining the communist resistance, and suffering Nazi retaliation.

Diversity and Held Belief

Gjirokastër is crowned by an impressive stone citadel, which gives the city its name (in Greek, Argyrokastro, which means silver castle). This citadel emphasizes the city's strategic importance. Indeed, it was for centuries an important place in the broader region, and it is often conceived of by the Greeks as the capital of Northern Epirus. Situated a short distance from the Greek border, it is the center of a multicultural district. Its strong Muslim-Albanian community coexists with an important Christian population composed of both Albanians and Greeks. While Gjirokastër is far from being a Greek town, most of its southern surroundings, known as Dryinoupolis or more popularly D(e)ropoli, a few kilometers from the city's center, are exclusively Greek. To the southeast of the city, lies another group of Greek villages which form the Albanian part of the historical Pogoni region, which continues into Greek territory. The third Christian element of Gjirokastër's district is the Vlachs. A mostly sedentary population today, in the recent past, they were present in the above district as pastoral nomads. Most of them are at least bilingual, and are viewed by many Greeks as a part of the Greek minority, while many Romanians still conceive them as their Balkan brothers. Today a visitor to Gjirokastër can also observe the existence of a Muslim Roma element.

This multicultural aspect of Gjirokastër and its surroundings is not fully reflected in *Chronicle in Stone*. Though we find the mention of a Christian toponym, the Holy-Trinity hill, in the city's vicinity⁹, we learn only about one Christian settlement, and this is not in an ordinary community, but a monastery. Furthermore, this

kolasos A. Stavrou: "Searching for a Brother Lost in Albania's Gulag", Mediterranean Quarterly 19:2 (2008), 47-81.

⁹ Ismail KADARE: Chronicle in Stone, ed. David Bellos, transl. Arshi Pipa, New York 2007, 273.

reference serves as an antireligious message, in accordance with the precepts of Hoxha's administration: the author reviles the monks' shrewdness, which created a miraculous saint's relic made from the hand of a British pilot, brought down during an air strike¹⁰. In *Chronicle in Stone* we also find one direct reference to the Muslim-Christian coexistence, but not in terms stating harmonious relations. When the author speaks about the displacement of the city's inhabitants into the citadel galleries destined to shelter them from the British bombs, he remarks: "This common roof housed people who had seemed irreconcilable: Karllashis and Angonis [two eternally rival families], Muslims and Christians, nuns and prostitutes, the scions of great families, street cleaners and gypsies"¹¹.

Another allusion to Christians in Kadare's book further reveals a deep hatred. More precisely, a few days before the Nazis' entrance in the city, on an evening when the communist partisans were trying to control the situation, the young narrator hears exclamations stating "Death to traitors! Albania for the Albanians!", "Death to fascism!", "Death to the *giaurs*!" This term *giaur* was mainly used by the Ottomans, sometimes with a pejorative connotation, to qualify the non-Muslims of their Empire, especially the Greeks and other Christians. Its presence in the Kadare text seems to reference the Christians who collaborated with the city's foreign oppressors. And according to Kadares' narration, these oppressors are not only the Italian fascist administration, but mainly the Greek army, which is far from being seen as a liberating force able to shake off, even temporarily, the fascist yoke¹³.

Occupiers and Collaborators

Though Kadare's pen constantly depicts the aversion of his compatriots against fascism, we never read a word of empathy for the Greeks' determination against fascism, which eventually culminated in their victory over the invading Italian army. The entrance of the Greek troops in Gjirokastër is heralded by the word "calamity", and presented as another sad episode in the city's long history, and not as part of an antifascist struggle able to unify Greeks and Albanians¹⁴. Kadare's writing even denounces some of the rich Christian families of his city as hosts to the commander of the Greek troops¹⁵. We also find the caricatured figure of Gjergj Pula, evidently a Christian Albanian according to his Christian name. His servility, during the Italian and Greek occupation, makes him change his name to Giorgio Pulo for the Italian and Yiorgos Poulos for the Greek, and who fully merits his epithet of "scoundrel" The Gjirokastër Christians' privileged position under the Greek oppressor is suggested by the recollection of a previous Greek occupation of the city which took place between the years 1919 and 1920. It was during this time that Greek gendarmes

```
Ibid., 284, see also 120–121, 123, 127–128, 147–148.
Ibid., 187.
Ibid., 261 ("giaours" is italicized in Chronicle in Stone).
Ibid., 261.
Ibid., 163–164, see also 137, 143.
Ibid., 165.
Ibid., 168–169, see also 170, 203, 278.
```

ZfB, 46 (2010) 1

were inclined to cut every non-Christian young male into pieces¹⁷. The Christian cross of the Greek flag is characterized as the "symbol of evil" announcing future blood spilling; and the author wonders: "how two crossed lines on a piece of fabric could arouse such grief" ¹⁸. We can conclude that in Kadare's text the Christian faith is mainly linked to the Greek and not with the Italian oppression.

In Chronicle in Stone the Greeks appear as foreign occupying soldiers, and never as a constituent element of the local population, with only one civilian exception: the evil figure of VASILIQIA, paralleled to cholera, plague and calamity; meanwhile she is considered a "holy maid" for the Greeks. In 1919-1920, she joined the Greek occupation forces, and in her efforts to ensure Greek domination, she designed the death of more than a hundred Albanian males. She is depicted running all over the city's streets and coffee houses, denouncing all who she considers subversive elements, implying that she is familiar with the city and its people. We also know that she left the city following the Greek troops towards the south, "where she came from", suggesting the Greek border, as well as the Greek southern surroundings of Gjirokastër 19. We understand that she is one of the local Christian traitors, who like the above mentioned Gjergj Pula and others, are referred to by the phrase "treachery hovered in the air"20. It was rumored that Vasiliqia returned to the city when the Greek army returned in 1941, and at the mere mention of her name, the relative calm of the previous Italian occupation was transformed into a state of panic²¹. A more fearful dominator than the Italians, the Greeks are presented as ready to release their furor against the city's population through a terrible massacre under Vasiliqia's guidance; eventually, the only victim is the bronze statue in the city's square, shot at by a drunken Greek sergeant, all the while Vasiliqia's return is never actually witnessed22.

Otherness and Self-Projected Ethnicity

The obvious reason that makes the Greeks a more dangerous occupier is the fact that they do not come from a distant land, like the Italians, and are directly involved with Gjirokastër's future. We see the Greek military authorities declaring with a big sign in the city square, Gjirokastër as part of Northern Epirus, claimed as their own national territory²³. Kadare along his narration does not fail to comment on the spread of the Greek language in his city after the entrance of the Greek troops. The Greek sounds are considered to be as invading as their creators, the Greek soldiers. The author hears these sounds assailing the oral expression in the coffee houses, the traditional centers of the Balkan social life. He also perceives the same Greek sounds as "thin and sharp, full of s's and th's that cut like razors". And immediately after, he makes note of the cutting objects intended to serve the Greeks' expansionist ambi-

```
17 Ibid., 164, 168.
```

¹⁸ Ibid., 164.

¹⁹ Ibid., 168.

²⁰ Ibid., 164.

²¹ Ibid., 166–168.

²² Ibid., 165–166, 170–171.

²³ Ibid., 165.

tions: the knives carried by all Greek soldiers, who are presented as ready to slaughter hundreds of people, like the city's butchers²⁴.

Kadare's text evidentially reflects the concern that the Christian Albanian speaking community could be attracted by the Greek propaganda, which had systematically mobilized the Greek Orthodox clergy in order to cultivate the Greek national conscience among the Christian Orthodox population of Albania and the neighboring region of Macedonia. Moreover, before the creation of the Albanian state, and even after, the Christian Orthodox Albanians, as well as the large majority of the local Vlachs, had adopted the Greek as the language of their church and culture. We have also to remark that before the era of the Balkan nationalisms, the distinction between the Greeks and Christian Albanians was not always obvious. I can evoke as a characteristic example the famous Albanian mercenary leader of the sixteenth century, Mercurius Bua (Bouas). His Greek bard, Zane KORONAIOS calls him the "chosen among the Greeks", and "rampart of the Albanians"; he also attacks those who contest Bua's Greekness and counts Pyrrhus, the king of ancient Epirus, among his ancestors²⁵. Furthermore, the fifteenth century national Albanian figure, Skanderbeg (†1468), champion of the anti-Ottoman resistance, will claim, in his correspondence, the origin of his people not only from Pyrrhus, but also from Alexander the Great's soldiers²⁶. We can also observe that a significant portion of the current population in Southern Greece, known as Arvanites (Alb. Arbëreshë, Gr. Αρβανίτες), are of distant Albanian origin and some speak even in our days an Albanian dialect, like the first president of the interbellic Hellenic Republic and national hero of Greece, Pavlos Kountouriotis (1855–1935)²⁷. As for the Albanian speaking people of Northern Greece they do not claim any other ethnic identity than the Greek, never being the subject of any particular polemic, as it happens with the Vlachs and the Slav speaking Greeks, who are still generating nationalistic discussions in Romania, the Republic of Macedonia and Greece. This common Greek-Albanian identity was based not only upon the Christian faith, but also by the wide use of common Greek, especially as written language, by the Albanians²⁸.

- 24 Ibid., 164, see also 21.
- 25 Constantinos N. Sathas: Ελληνικά ανέκδοτα περισυναχθέντα και εκδιδόμενα [Greek inedited texts, collected and edited] I, Athens 1867; reprint ibid. 1982, ι'-ια' (=10-1), 4.
- 26 Ibid., θ΄-ιβ΄ (=9-12); Andronikos Falangas: "Μοφφές Ηπειφωτών στις φουμανικές χώφες κατά τον ύστεφο Βαλκανικό Μεσαίωνα" ["Epirotan Personalities in the Romanian Lands during the Later Balkan Middle Ages"], Dodone 33 (2004), 425 (n. 99).
- 27 Titos Jochalas: Über die Einwanderung der Albaner in Griechenland: Eine zusammenfassende Betrachtung. Munich 1971; Alain Ducellier: Οι Αλβανοί στην Ελλάδα, 13–15 αι.: Η μετανάστευση μίας κοινότητας [The Albanians in Greece, 13th–15th c.: The migration of a community]. Athens 1994.
- 28 See Angeliki Konstantakopoulou: Η ελληνική γλώσσα στα Βαλκάνια 1750–1850, Το τετφάγλωσσο λεξικό του Δανιήλ Μοσχοπολίτη [The Greek language in the Balkans 1750–1850. The dictionary in four languages of Daniel Moschopolite]. Ioannina 1988.

Traditional Stereotypes and Illusory Correlation

Let's now return to Kadare's text. Alongside the two traitors, Vasiliqia and Pula, we also find in his narration two human figures, who, even if they do not support the foreign occupation, are able to accept it with indifference or accommodate themselves in it. And both of them are presented as marginal or blamable elements of the city's society.

The first is Llukan, nicknamed the Jailbird. He is an incorrigible delinquent who spent most of his life in the citadel's jail for minor crimes. Unable to integrate into the city's society, he finds himself best in the carceral life²⁹. This state of alienation forces him declare his indifference to the Italian and Greek occupation, his only concern being the prison's good functioning³⁰. As for the second person, he is the bisexual Bufe Hasani, who in accordance with the values of the patriarchal society of Gjirokastër and the moral precepts of the communist regime³¹, is depicted as an immoral and shameful person. More precisely, he is a married man who profits from the presence of the foreign soldiers, Italians and Greeks, in order to satisfy his homosexual passions. After a venture with a Greek soldier, his exasperated wife denounces her "filthy" husband, as she qualifies him, to the local society, emphasizing that his lover is a Greek. He is sharply gossiped about by the city's respectable ladies, like the narrators' grandmother who cannot suffer seeing the "Greek jackboots"³², as she embraces the attitude of the esteemed and patriotic Albanian. She exclaims "What a disgrace", while another old lady in her circle cries out: "Better to be dead and buried than to hear the news there is"³³.

Llukan and Bufe Hasani are not the only marginal characters in *Chronicle in Stone*. We see the appearance of an entire group of fringe individuals belonging to the Roma people, who are referred to as Gypsies. In contrast to the Greeks and Vlachs, the Roma people are the only native ethnic elements of the author's homeland present in *Chronicle in Stone* alongside the Albanians. Their emergence in Kadare's book seems framed by the fact that the Roma are not conceived of as a menace to Albania's integrity. Unlike the Greeks and the Vlachs, they have never expressed any territorial revendication, nor were they claimed by any Balkan nationalistic propaganda, and they never created a nationalism of their own. The authors' opinion of their social place can be easily perceived by the reader. As I previously mentioned, he contrasts the Gypsies along with street cleaners to the scions of the city's great families³⁴. We see also the Gypsies servilely relying on the author's grandfather: living in a shack on his property, they play violin for his pleasure during the summer evenings; and these summer concerts appear as a way to compensate for their incapacity to pay their rent for years, for the obvious reason that they are unable to exercise any lucrative activ-

```
29 Kadare, 19, 149, 255.
```

³⁰ Ibid., 144.

³¹ Ibid., xii-xiii (introduction by D. Bellos).

³² Ibid., 163.

³³ Ibid., 169, cf. 171, where the narrator refers to "the shameful behavior of Bufe Hasani".

³⁴ Supra, n. 29.

ity³⁵. They also obediently follow the old man and his relatives in their occasional refuge into the citadel, forming, as the author emphasizes, their retinue³⁶. Finally, we hear about a drunken Gypsy jumping to his death from the citadel during a municipal ceremony³⁷. Consequently, we can conclude that, in Kadares' view, the Roma people belong to the margins of Gjirokastër's society.

The most interesting and shocking of Kadare's references to the Gypsies is in his linking them to the Greeks. More precisely, he evokes the physical characteristic of the Greek occupier, specifically the particularity of his skin. Indeed, all the Greek soldiers are presented as having "very dark complexions". This statement poses the following question expressed by the narrator's young friend: "Do the Greeks belong to the gypsies?" The narrator initially responds with "I don't know", but immediately, he realizes that, despite their swarthiness, they do not share with Gypsies the same passion for music. So he reconsiders his answer: "I don't think so. None of them has a violin or clarinet" "38".

The evocation by Kadare of the Greeks' dark skin, as well as their parallelism to the Roma people, generates two reflections. The first is: the Greeks are compared with a people, like the Roma, who according to a traditional racist stereotype, are destined to play a marginal role in human society, the Romas' alleged inferiority often being associated with the dark color of their skin. The second reflection can be formulated as the following question: does the author make the association of the Greek's dark complexion with human vice and inferiority? In other words: does Chronicle in Stone project the idea of the bad-swarthy foreigner in accordance with the discriminatory old American stereotype targeting the Southern European or non-European immigrants?³⁹ We can verify the suggestive meaning of the Greeks' dark

- 35 Ibid., 49, 50, 55-56.
- 36 Ibid., 187.
- 37 Ibid., 150.
- 38 Ibid., 172.
- 39 This idea is fully illustrated in the following passage from Samuel P. ORTH: Our Foreigners, A Chronicle of Americans in the Making. New Haven, Toronto, London, Oxford 1920, 181-182: "Northern Italy is the home of the old masters in art and literature and of a new industrialism that is bringing renewed prosperity to Milan and Turin. Here the virile native stock has been strengthened with the blood of its northern neighbors. They are a capable, creative, conservative, reliable race. On the other hand, the hot temper of the South has been fed by an infusion of Greek and Saracen blood. In Sicily this strain shows at its worst. There the vendetta flourishes; and the Camorra and its sinister analogue, the Black Hand, but too realistically remind us that thousands of these swarthy criminals [I underscore] have found refuge in the dark alleys of our cities." Consequently, the author concluded with the analogous statements: "The north Italians readily identify themselves with American life. [...] In spite of his native sociability, the south Italian is very slow to take to American ways": Ibid., 182-183; see also, Daniel J. TICHENOR: Dividing Lines, The Politics of Immigration Control in America. Princeton, Oxford 2002, 78-80. About the social status and the ability to integrate "Dark Caucasoids" within American society during the period of the World War II: William Lloyd WARNER and Leo SROLE: The Social Systems of the American Ethnic Groups. New Haven, London, Oxford 1945, 284-96 (subchapter: Race, Culture, and American Subordinate Groups).

complexion, by comparing it with another contrasting physical characteristic present in Kadares' narration: the fair hair. Just before the devastating arrival of the Nazi troops in Gjirokastër, an unknown person utters the following words related to the German soldiers: "Don't give me that about yellow hair" It obviously means that fairness, despite its positive inference, could be associated with evil behavior Consequently, I can assert that racial stereotypes, with their traditional, yet negative reasoning, have a place in Kadare's work, in his effort to generate a certain impression against the Greeks viewed exclusively as foreign invaders.

Finally, I would like to observe as a conclusion to this paper, that the Balkan ethnic and political complexity, combined with typical traditionalisms, is certainly a cause for local tensions and antagonisms, sometimes resulting in disastrous effects. Furthermore, these factors create a Balkan state of mind which is reflected even in one of the finest examples of Modern European literary production, as it is undoubtedly represented in Kadare's *Chronicle in Stone*.

⁴⁰ Kadare, 291.

⁴¹ Elsewhere, the narrator associates the eruption of witchcraft in his city just before the outbreak of war with the evil appearance of a "dark skinned" woman at the door of a local housewife: Ibid., 31.